

Rhonda Miller - MVLWB

From: Kathleen Graham [kgraham@mvlwb.com]
Sent: August-17-11 9:02 AM
To: permits@mvlwb.com
Subject: FW: RE: Jean Carter and family response to NTPC application for licence renewal

From: Dean Carter [mailto:dlcarter@shaw.ca]
Sent: Sunday, August 14, 2011 9:54 PM
To: Kathleen Graham
Subject: Re: RE: Jean Carter and family response to NTPC application for licence renewal

Hello Kathleen,
Unfortunately I will not be able to attend the conference tomorrow in Yellowknife. I would certainly appreciate being able to participate by teleconference if it can be arranged. My telephone number to be connected is:

1-604-291-9194

If you have any difficulties contacting on the above number (my home phone) you may try contacting on my cell phone at 604-727-7578

Thank you Kathleen. Your assistance is much appreciated.

Sincerely,
Dean Carter

----- Original Message -----

From: Kathleen Graham <kgraham@mvlwb.com>
Date: Monday, August 8, 2011 2:10 pm
Subject: RE: Jean Carter and family response to NTPC application for licence renewal
To: 'Dean Carter' <dlcarter@shaw.ca>

> Hello Dean,
>
> Is any member of your family planning to attend Monday's Taltson
> TechnicalSession? Or will someone participate via
> teleconference? I am trying to
> determine attendance to order catering.

>
> Regards,
>
> Kathleen

>
>
> From: Dean Carter [mailto:dlcarter@shaw.ca]
> Sent: Friday, July 29, 2011 1:30 PM
> To: aplautz@mvlwb.com

> Cc: kgraham@mvlwb.com; jccarter@northwestel.net; mlcarter@telus.net

> Subject: Jean Carter and family response to NTPC application for

> licencerenewal

>

>

>

> Hi Cynthia:

>

> My mother has asked that I forward on behalf of our family the

> following comments to be presented to the Mackenzie Valley Land

> and Water Board

> regarding NTPC application for licence renewal for waters on the

> Talston River, including Nonacho, Hjalmar and Gray Lakes.

>

> Please contact me should you have any questions.

>

> Sincerely,

>

> Dean Carter

>

> 1-604-727-7578 (cell)

>

>

>

>

>

> MACKENZIE VALLEY LAND AND WATER BOARD

> FILE; MV2011L4-0002

> RE: NTPC TALSTON HYDO REVISED WORK PLAN FOR RENEWAL APPLICATION

>

> ATTENTION: ANGELA PLAUTZ, REGULATORY POLICY ADVISOR, MVLWB

>

> FOLLOWING ARE COMMENTS THAT ARE OF GREAT CONCERN TO MY FAMILY

> AND MYSELF.

>

> MY FAMILY AND I HAVE BEEN TOURISM OPERATORS ON NONACHO LAKE FOR

> THE PAST

> FIFTY YEARS. PRIOR TO 1962, MY LATE HUSBAND MERLYN WAS ALSO

> INVOLVED IN A

> COMMERCIAL FISHERY THERE FROM THE 1950'S. WE HAVE OBSERVED

> CHANGES OVER THE

> PAST HALF CENTURY THAT IN OUR VIEW HAS CAUSED SUBSTANTIAL

> ENVIRONMENTAL DAMAGE AS A RESULT OF THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE LAND

> FILL RESERVOIR (DAM) ON

> NONACHO LAKE IN THE 1960'S. SIMILAR CONCERNS HAVE ALSO

> BEEN VOICED BY

> ABORIGINAL HUNTERS, TRAPPERS AND FISHERMEN FROM NEARBY LUTSEL K'E

> WHO SPENT

> SUBSTANTIAL PARTS OF THE YEAR AT NONACHO LAKE IN THE YEARS PRIOR

> TO, DURING

> AND FOLLOWING THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE NONACHO ROCK FILL DAM.

- >
- > THESE CONCERNS NEED TO BE ADDRESSED BEFORE THIS WORK PLAN FOR RENEWAL APPLICATION IS APPROVED.
- >
- > 1. EROSION OF THE SHORELINE AND SAND ESKER THAT WE SEE EVERYDAY WHILE AT NONACHO. FURTHER FLUCTUATION IN THE SHORELINE WILL ONLY RESULT IN MORE DAMAGE.
- >
- > 2. HIGH WATER LEVELS HAS DESTROYED ONE OF OUR BUILDINGS. ANOTHER BUILDING HAD TO BE MOVED BACK TWICE IN THE 1970'S. HIGH WATER LEVELS ALSO PREVENTS US GETTING TO ONE CABIN EXCEPT BY BOAT.
- >
- > 3. RE. EROSION, MY LEASE STATES ON PAGE 4 UNDER ENVIRONMENTAL, CLAUSE 18 - THE LESSEE SHALL NOT DO ANYTHING WHICH WILL CAUSE EROSION OF THE BANKS OF ANY BODY OF WATER ON OR ADJACENT TO THE LAND, AND SHALL PROVIDE NECESSARY CONTROLS TO PREVENT SUCH EROSION. IT ALSO STATES ON PAGE 4 UNDER ENVIRONMENTAL, CLAUSE 17 - THE LESSEE SHALL AT ALL TIMES KEEP THE LAND IN A CONDITION SATISFACTORY TO THE MINISTER. AS CONSCIENTIOUS ENVIRONMENTAL KEEPERS, WE STRONGLY OBJECT TO ANY OTHER PARTY BEING ABLE TO DO OTHERWISE.
- >
- >
- >
- > 4. HIGH MERCURY LEVELS IN THE FISH HAVE BEEN OBSERVED ON NONACHO AND HJALMAR LAKES FROM FLESH ANALYSIS SAMPLES OF LAKE TROUT AND NORTHERN PIKE TAKEN BY DFO SCIENTISTS IN THE 1970'S AND 1980'S. FOR EXAMPLE: A REVIEW OF FISH STOCKS ON NONACHO LAKE PREPARED BY D.B. STEWART FOR DEPARTMENT OF FISHERIES AND OCEANS IN 1999 CONCLUDED THAT WHEN FISH IN NONACHO LAKE WERE TESTED IN 1986 FOR MERCURY, LAKE TROUT WERE FOUND TO BE OF LEVELS NOT SUITABLE FOR COMMERCIAL SALE.
- >
- > 5. SUBSEQUENT TESTING CONFIRM MERCURY LEVELS REMAIN HIGH. ON JUNE 28, 2011 THE CHIEF PUBLIC HEALTH OFFICER OF THE NORTHWEST TERRITORIES RELEASED A PUBLIC HEALTH ADISORY RE. LIMITING THE CONSUMPTION OF LAKE TROUT EATEN FROM

- > NONACHO LAKE. ALTHOUGH NORTHERN PIKE REMAINS THE CHOICE
- > SPORT FISH OF SOME
- > OF OUR TOURIST FISHERMEN, TO OUR KNOWLEDGE RECENT MERCURY
- > TESTING WAS NOT
- > COMPLETED ON THIS FISH SPECIES.
- >
- > 6. CYSTS ABUNDANT IN THE FLESH. THESE CYSTS
- > WERE NOT PRESENT BEFORE
- > NONACHO LAKE BECAME A RESERVOIR FOR THE TALSTON RIVER HYDRO ELECTRIC
- > FACILITY AT TWIN GORGES. THIS CAN BE CONFIRMED BY
- > SUSTENANCE ABORIGINAL
- > HUNTERS AND FISHERMEN FROM THE NEARBY COMMUNITY OF L'UTSEL K'E.
- >
- > 7. THE RISING OF WATERS ON NONACHO LAKE FROM THE "NONACHO
- > LAKE DAM" HAS
- > DESTROYED THE PORTION OF THE TALSTON RIVER BETWEEN NONACHO AND
- > GRAY LAKES,
- > ESENTIALLY CREATING ONE LAKE WITH A SERIES OF NARROWS BETWEEN
- > THE TWO LAKES.
- > THE DESTRUCTION OF A SUBSTANTIAL RIVER CURRENT IN THIS PART OF
- > THE TALSTON
- > RIVER HAS DESTROYED THE HABITAT OF THE ARCTIC GRAYLING. WE
- > HAVE NOT
- > OBSERVED ANY ARCTIC GRAYLING ON NONACHO LAKE IN NEARLY 40 YEARS.
- >
- > 8. THE NONACHO LAKE DAM HAS RAISED WATER LEVELS ON NONACHO LAKE
- > TO HEIGHTS
- > WHEREBY NONACHO LAKE IS NOW FLOWING INTO TRONKA CHUA LAKE. THIS
- > HAS RESULTED
- > IN TWO OUTLETS FLOWING FROM NONACHO LAKE. THERE WAS NO
- > CONNECTIVITY BETWEEN
- > THESE TWO LAKES PRIOR TO THE EARLY 1970'S AND MAPS PUBLISHED
- > PRIOR TO 1970
- > WILL CONFIRM THIS. TO OUR KNOWLEDGE NO DOCUMENTED SCIENTIFIC
- > STUDIES HAVE
- > EVER BEEN CONDUCTED TO ASSESS THE ENVIRONMENTAL RAMIFICATIONS
- > THIS HAS
- > CAUSED TO EITHER THE TRONKA CHUA OR NONACHO LAKE SYSTEMS.
- >
- > 9. APPROXIMATELY 1000 MILES OF NONACHO AND HJALMAR LAKE
- > SHORELINES ARE
- > STREWN WITH AN UNSIGHTLY MESS OF DEAD TREES. SOME OF THESE DEAD TREES
- > LOCATED ON NORTHERN NONACHO LAKE, ONLY MILES FROM THE BARREN
- > LANDS, WERE
- > NEARLY THREE FEET IN DIAMETER.
- >
- > THE ENVIRONMENTAL DAMAGE CREATED ON THE TALSTON RIVER AT
- > NONACHO, HJALMAR
- > AND GRAY LAKES BY THE ROCK FILL DAM ON NONACHO LAKE HAS BEEN AND
- > REMAINS SUBSTANTIAL:
- >

> (A. ELEVATED MERCURY LEVELS RESULTING IN A RECENT PUBLIC
> HEALTH WARNING RE.
> HUMAN CONSUMPTION OF LAKE TROUT;
>
> (B. DESTRUCTION OF HABITAT OF THE ARCTIC GRAYLING;
>
> (C. SOIL EROSION;
>
> (D. ELEVATED WATER LEVELS ON NONACHO CREATING A LAKE WITH
> TWO OUTFLOWING
> RIVERS. THIS MAKES NONACHO ONE OF THE ONLY LAKES ON EARTH
> WITH TWO
> OUTFLOWS;
>
> (E. OTHER COMMENTS AS NOTED ABOVE.
>
>
>
> AS A RESULT WE BELIEVE GRANTING THE APPLICANT A WATER LICENCE
> FOR A FURTHER
> 25 YEARS TO BE EXCESSIVE. FURTHERMORE, SHOULD A WATER
> LICENCE BE GRANTED,
> SOME FORM OF ROUTINE CHECKS OUGHT TO BE IN PLACE ENSURING
> ACCOUNTABILITY ON
> THE PART OF THE APPLICANT.
>
> WE TRUST THE ABOVE COMMENTS WILL BE TREATED IN A MANNER THAT
> REFLECTS THE
> THOUGHT "WE CAN'T LIVE JUST FOR TODAY BUT ALSO FOR
> TOMORROW. IF WE LIVE
> JUST FOR TODAY, THERE WILL BE NO TOMORROW".
>
> THANK YOU KINDLY FOR GIVING US THE OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT ON
> THIS SUBJECT
> AND TO HAVE THESE CONCERNS ADDRESSED.
>
> YOURS TRULY,
>
> JEAN CARTER
> DEAN CARTER
> MYLES CARTER
> KANDEE FROESE
>
>
>
>
>
>

Rhonda Miller - MVLWB

From: Kathleen Graham [kgraham@mvlwb.com]
Sent: August-18-11 10:54 AM
To: permits@mvlwb.com
Subject: FW: Lake trout cysts in Nonacho

From: Hanna, Bruce [mailto:Bruce.Hanna@dfo-mpo.gc.ca]
Sent: Thursday, August 18, 2011 10:56 AM
To: Kathleen Graham; Angela Plautz - MVLWB
Subject: Lake trout cysts in Nonacho

Hi, just as an FYI the Carters will be taking photos of the cysts Jean Carter was concerned with and sending them to me. I have a research scientist at the DFO Pacific Biological Station that will examine the photos. If he can't positively id them he'll send a collection protocol to the Carters and he'll analyze the samples when they send them over.

All for now.

Bruce

Bruce Hanna

Senior Habitat Biologist | Biologiste, Habitat
(867) 669-4931 | facsimile/ télécopieur (867) 669-4940

Bruce.Hanna@dfo-mpo.gc.ca

Fish Habitat Management, Western Arctic Area | Gestion de l'Habitat du Poisson, Secteur de l'Arctique de l'Ouest
Central and Arctic Region | Région Centrale et de l'Arctique
Fisheries and Oceans Canada | 301-5204 50th Ave, Yellowknife, NT, X1A 1E2
Pêches et Océans Canada | 301-5204 50^e Ave, Yellowknife, T.N.-O, X1A 1E2
Government of Canada | Gouvernement du Canada